1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	United States Attorney JOANN M. SWANSON, CSBN 88143 Assistant United States Attorney Chief, Civil Division ILA C. DEISS, NY SBN 3052909 Assistant United States Attorney  450 Golden Gate Avenue, Box 36055 San Francisco, California 94102 Telephone: (415) 436-7124 FAX: (415) 436-7169  Attorneys for Defendants		
9			
10	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
11	SAN JOSE DIVISION		
12	12 NOLAN WAI-YIP DUONG,		
13		No. C 07-3018 JW	
14	Plaintiffs, )  14	ANSWER	
15	v. )		
16 17	MICHAEL CHERTOFF, Secretary of the Department of Homeland Security; NOBERT S. MUELLER, Director of Federal		
18	)		
19	)		
20	Defendants hereby submit their answer to Plaintiffs' Complaint for Writ in the Nature of		
21	, i		
22		1. Defendants admit that the I-485 remains pending, however, the I-130 was approved on June	
23			
24			
25	2. Defendants admit the allegations in Paragraph Two with the exception that the applications		
26	were filed on November 14, 2003, and the Notice date		
27	3. Defendants admit the allegations in Paragraph 7	3. Defendants admit the allegations in Paragraph Three.	
28	4. Defendants admit the allegations in Paragraph F	4. Defendants admit the allegations in Paragraph Four.	
	Answer C07-3018 JW		

#### **JURISDICTION**

5. Paragraph Five consists of Plaintiffs' allegation regarding jurisdiction, to which no responsive pleading is required; however, to the extent a responsive pleading is deemed necessary, Defendants deny the allegations in this paragraph.

### **VENUE**

6. Paragraph Six consists of Plaintiffs' allegations regarding venue, to which no responsive pleading is required; however, to the extent a responsive pleading is deemed necessary, Defendants deny the allegations in this paragraph.

## **EXHAUSTION OF REMEDIES**

7. Defendants deny the allegations in Paragraph Seven.

#### **CAUSE OF ACTION**

- 8. Defendants admit the allegations in Paragraph Eight with the exception that the filing date is November 14, 2003.
- 9. Defendants admit that the I-130 was approved on June 2, 2004, and the I-485 remains pending. Defendants are without sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in Paragraph Nine.
- 10. Paragraph Ten consists of Plaintiffs' characterization of the lawsuit, and thus no admission or denial is required; however, to the extent that such allegations are deemed to require an answer, Defendants deny the allegations in this paragraph.
- 11. Paragraph Eleven consists of Plaintiffs' characterization of the lawsuit, and thus no admission or denial is required; however, to the extent that such allegations are deemed to require an answer, Defendants deny the allegations in this paragraph.
  - 11(a): Plaintiff's I-130 was approved on June 2, 2004.
- 11(b): Plaintiff has applied for and was granted Advanced Parole valid from September 3, 2005 to September 2, 2006.
- 11(c): Plaintiff applied for and has received three employment authorization documents (EAD) giving her authorization to work in the United States.
  - 11(d): Paragraph Eleven subparagraph d consists of Plaintiff's characterization of the lawsuit,

Answer C07-3018 JW

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

and thus no admission or denial is required.12. Paragraph Twelve consists of Plaint

12. Paragraph Twelve consists of Plaintiffs' conclusions of law, and thus no admission or denial is required; however, to the extent that such allegations are deemed to require an answer, Defendants deny the allegations in this paragraph.

# **PRAYER**

13. Paragraph Thirteen consists of Plaintiffs' prayer for relief, to which no admission or denial is required; to the extent a responsive pleading is deemed to be required, Defendants deny this paragraph.

## FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' complaint fails to state a claim upon which relief may be granted.

# SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

The court should dismiss the complaint under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) because Plaintiffs cannot establish that Defendants' duty to act is ministerial, that no other adequate remedy is available, or that Plaintiffs have a clear right to the relief sought. *See* 28 U.S.C. § 1361.

WHEREFORE, Defendants pray for relief as follows:

That judgment be entered for Defendants and against Plaintiffs, dismissing Plaintiffs' complaint with prejudice; that Plaintiffs take nothing; and that the Court grant such further relief as it deems just and proper under the circumstances.

Dated: August 13, 2007	Respectfully submitted,
	SCOTT N. SCHOOLS

United States Attorney

ILA C. DEISS
Assistant United States Attorney
Attorneys for Defendants